

# Duty to Protect Consumer Information

## Emerging Legal Trends

**Ann Geyer, JD**  
**Tunitas Group**



**ISACA**  
**April 1, 2009**

# Information Protection is Expanding

## Separating information from computer assets

- Protecting information ownership

- Recognizing consumer privacy rights

## Safe Harbors

- Limiting liability if security is implemented

## Duty to protect

- Imposing legal duties and liability to control, to warn, to avoid disclosures

# Legal Perspective on Liability

## Liability means

To be accountable to another or society

Enforceable by civil remedy or criminal punishment

# Legal Perspective on Liability

## Liability means

To be accountable to another or society

Enforceable by civil remedy or criminal punishment

## In other words

A *duty* – that is breached, that creates a wrong, that is compensable

# Duty is Established in Two Ways

## Case Law

Court decisions rendered in private lawsuits

## Statutory Law

Laws, regulations and enforcement actions

# Private Lawsuits

Individuals sue for a legal remedy

## Tort Theories

Negligence-ordinary or professional

Breach of fiduciary duty--directors, officers, attorneys, trustees, agents, spouses, guardians . . .

Invasion of Privacy—disclosure of private facts

Emotion distress—pain & suffering, fear, anxiety

Misrepresentation—false statements inducing reliance

## Contract Theories

Breach of contract

Breach of warranty

# Plaintiff's Have a High Burden under Negligence

Plaintiff must prove—Duty, Breach, Causation, Injury

## Duty

General duty -- Reasonable care to a foreseeable person

Special duties – Duty to warn, to control, to rescue

# Negligence

## Breach

### Balancing Test

Gravity/Likelihood of harm to Consumer  
Burden/Utility to Company

Unexcused statutory duty

Probably negligent

# Negligence

Causation—Is it reasonable to hold this defendant liable?

Defendant's conduct is the actual cause of injury

The injury is foreseeable

No independent intervening force

# Negligence

## Injury

Differs for different torts

## Negligence

Must first establish personal injury or property damage

Emotional damages or economic losses can then be tacked on

# Low Success Rate for Plaintiffs

## Several recurrent difficulties

No actual injury shown

Can't prove security breach caused the injury

Injury characterized as pure economic harm

Medical monitoring arguments not well accepted

# Contract Theories

Plaintiff must have an “agreement” with the breaching party

Must have promised – *Privacy & Security Statements*

- To protect privacy

- Not to disclose

- Provide state of the art security

- Your data is safe with us

## Main Contract Theory Problems

- Was the information given in exchange for the privacy statement?

- Are the damages legally certain?

# Security Breach Awareness Builds

100 million consumers affected by security breaches annually

Technical arms race between criminals and infosec professionals is escalating

Businesses must do better to protect consumers

Politically necessary to hold someone responsible

# Identity Theft Top FTC Consumer Complaint

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Complaint</u>	<u>No.</u>	<u>%</u>
1	Identity Theft	313,982	26
2	Collection Agencies	104,642	9
3	Telemarketers	52,615	4
4	Internet Services	52,102	4
5	Check Scams	38,505	3
6	Credit Bureaus	34,940	3
7	Sweepstakes & Lotteries	33,340	3
8	TV/Cable	25,930	2
9	Banks and Lenders	22,890	2
10	Telephone Services	22,387	2
11	Computers	21,442	2
13	Internet Auction	17,294	1
15	Health Care	16,275	1

# FTC Steps In

## Federal Trade Commission (FTC) Act

Gives FTC broad authority to enforce consumer protection laws

## Key theories applied to data security

Deceptive or unfair trade practice (FTC § 5)

Safeguards Rule (Gramm-Leach-Bliley)

Fair Credit Reporting Act (FCRA)

# FTC is a Formidable Adversary

Has both regulatory and enforcement authority

Investigates  
Files charges  
Adjudicates

Issues injunctions  
Levies fines  
Consent decrees

Named Enforcement Agency

Anti-trust/monopolies  
False advertising  
Credit fraud  
Debt collection

Truth in lending  
Health warnings  
Product labels  
Medical privacy

# Deceptive or Unfair Practices

FTC positions itself as the arbiter of corporate data security

Initially targeted privacy statements on websites

Moved on to implied promise to protect information from disclosure

Any breach is a disclosure

Failure to implement reasonable security measures

# 45+ Complaints since 2000

Failure to provide reasonable security to protect sensitive customer data

## Many Prominent Names

Geocities

Tower

CardSystems

Seisint

Eli Lilly

PETCO

DSW

TJX

Microsoft

BJ Wholesale

Guidance

Hannaford

Guess

ChoicePoint

LexisNexis

Geek.com

# Consistent Charges

Failure to implement reasonable security measures

Using default or common passwords

Storing unencrypted consumer information

Transmitting unencrypted data on internal networks

Retaining data longer than necessary

Failing to implement detective controls

Using shared passwords for distinct administrator functions

Failing to prevent wireless access to network

Failing to employ IDS products or review audit logs

# Consistent Settlements

10-20 year consent agreements

Fines from \$100K to \$15M

Specific requirements

- Assign a designated security official

- Implement a managed security program

- Assess risk to consumer data

- Implement reasonable security safeguards/controls

- Proactively monitor security status

- Respond to changing risk environments

# FTC Targets

## Companies with low security expectations and priorities

- Weak or obsolete security controls

- Limited detective controls

- Lacking a well-defined and professionally managed security program

- Failed to detect & correct problems in timely manner

# FTC Security Principles

1. All companies have a legal duty to implement reasonable security
2. Security procedures must be appropriate for the level of sensitivity of the information
3. Reasonable and appropriate security measures may insulate a breach
4. Laws may be violated without a breach
5. Static security measures are not acceptable

# FTC Standards for Safeguarding Customer Info

## Defines reasonable security

Designate a coordinating person

Identify and assess risks and evaluate controls

Design and implement program to address risks

Regularly test and monitor effectiveness of program

Oversee service providers who have access to protected information

Evaluate and adjust program to address weaknesses or new risks

# Reasonable Security means Good Governance

Data Security is considered a Fiduciary Duty

The Board, CEO, CFO, Sr. Management

Must approve the security program

Oversee development, implementation, & maintenance

Be informed through regular reporting

*In short—data security must be a visible part of corp governance*

# Reasonable Security means Defined Process

General focus is on *process of security*  
not any specific security policy, product or standard

Legal standard is at a minimum

Defined process--documented and communicated

Managed process--monitored and measured

# A Defined Process for Reasonable Security

1. Identify the assets to be protected  
Both under company control and outsourced
2. Assess risk  
Identify and evaluate threats, vulnerabilities, and damages  
Consider available options
3. Manage by means of a documented security program  
That is responsive to the risk assessment  
That addresses the required categories of controls
4. Continually monitor, reassess, and adjust  
To ensure it is effective  
To address new threats, vulnerabilities, and options
5. Address third parties

# States React

## Legislation

- Notice laws

- Strict Liability laws

## State Unfair Trade Practice Laws

## Bully Pulpit

- CT AG demands payment

- No court case or statute

# March 2008 Texas AG and CVS Settlement

Overhaul information security program

Implement new employee training program

Designate an employee to oversee compliance

Create anonymous reporting process for failure to comply w/order

Post signs in each store - proper records storage and disposal procedures

Conduct unannounced compliance checks at 3% of stores every six months

Pay a \$315,000 fine

# General Summary of Trends

The general duty to provide security for consumer information is being expanded and clarified

A legal standard for reasonable security is emerging from government enforcement activities and case law

Reasonable security is based on

- Governance

- Defined process

Failure to provide reasonable security creates legal liability